GROWTH OF THE FILAMENTOUS GREEN ALGA Ctenocladus circinatus (CHAETOPHORALES, CHLOROPHYCEAE) IN RELATION TO ENVIRONMENTAL SALINITY

David B. Herbst
Sierra Nevada Aquatic Research Laboratory, University of California, Star Route 1, Box 198, Mammoth Lakes, California 93546

and

Richard W. Castenhed
Department of Biology, University of Oregon, Eugene, Oregon 97405

ABSTRACT
Clones of the filamentous green alga Ctenocladus circinatus Borzì were isolated from algae collected at Abert Lake (Oregon) and Mono Lake (California). Stock cultures were exposed to varied salinities of natural lake water to examine the effects on growth rate, cell form, chlorophyll a, and water content. Growth rates were reduced in both clones with increased salinity over the range 25-100 g L⁻¹ and were almost completely inhibited at 156 g L⁻¹. Chlorophyll a increased between salinities of 25 and 100 g L⁻¹, indicating slower growth, higher proportions of akinetes, and smaller cell sizes as salinity increased. Tissue water content remained essentially constant from 25 to 100 g L⁻¹ salinity. Shorter cell dimensions with increased salinity suggest that a lower surface-to-volume ratio may reduce the potential for passive loss of cell water. Prior acclimation of stock cultures to elevated salinity provided no enhancement of growth response at any salinity. The results indicate that environmental salinity can limit the productivity and distribution of Ctenocladus in nature.

Key index words: algal physiology; Abert Lake; benthic algal; Chlorophyta; Ctenocladus circinatus; Mono Lake; salinity tolerance; periphyton

The filamentous green alga Ctenocladus circinatus Borzì is known primarily from western North America and Asia (Blinn and Stein 1970) and lives in saline inland waters and coastal brine pools. Vegetative cell growth in Ctenocladus occurs in the form of branching filaments that produce terminal thick-walled akinetes, often in chain-like rows. Formation of the dormant akinetes is induced by unfavorable conditions, and this stage is resistant to damage from freezing, desiccation, or saturated brines. Asexual reproduction occurs under favorable conditions by the release of motile zoospores, which settle on the substrate to form new filaments. Although isogamous sexual reproduction has been described (Smith 1950), Blinn (1970) concluded that akinete formation was the most important life history feature contributing to the persistence of Ctenocladus. Ctenocladus usually exhibits an attached epilithic growth habit, but germination of free-floating akinetes, zoospores, or detached vegetative cells often leads to radial growth of filaments that eventually form floating or loose benthic trails. These wash ashore and are often seen along the margins of salt lakes and ponds. Previous experimental studies of environmental factors influencing Ctenocladus have either employed only akinete germination as a bioassay (Blinn 1971) or used solutions of NaCl rather than natural source waters to examine growth (Kuimet 1953). Our study extends these earlier investigations by constructing vegetative growth curves for different clones of Ctenocladus in varied salinities of natural waters from permanent, alkaline lakes.

Seasonal observations of Ctenocladus at Abert Lake (Oregon) and Mono Lake (California) suggested that substantial differences in the abundance of this alga existed between these lakes (Herbst 1988). At Abert Lake, floating trails and thick mats of Ctenocladus attached to rock surfaces cover a major portion of the shoreline and littoral lake bottom. At Mono Lake, only sparse tufts were present, often in shaded and protected crevices of calcareous tufa rock. At the time of these observations (spring-summer 1983), Mono Lake was more saline (83 g L⁻¹) than Abert Lake (25 g L⁻¹), although both are alkaline (pH 10) sodium chlorocarbonate-type lakes. Earlier collections of attached Ctenocladus from Mono Lake (in 1968, D. W. Blinn, pers. commun.) indicate the alga was easier to locate and more abundant during this period of lower salinity (ca. 70 g L⁻¹). These observations suggested the hypothesis that Ctenocladus productivity and distribution is limited by increasing environmental salinity. The objective of the research reported here is to test this hypothesis by comparing algal growth over a range of salinities using clones derived from Mono and Abert lakes.

MATERIALS AND METHODS
Tufts of Ctenocladus were collected from rock substrates at both Abert and Mono lakes in spring 1985. Clones were isolated as single filaments using sterile forceps to pull a free strand repeatedly over a sterile 1.5% agar surface to remove adhering algae. 588
Single filaments of each constituent were cut out of the agar in small blocks and dropped into filtered source lake water (Whitman GF/A) to establish a series of stock clone cultures from each lake. Stock cultures derived from a single clone from each lake were used as the source inoculum for all experiments. They were grown in filtered lake water adjusted to a specific gravity of 1.030 at 20°C (ca. 40 g L⁻¹) prior to inoculation into treatment salinities. Separate subsamples of these clones were also transferred into lake water adjusted to a specific gravity of 1.050 (ca. 65 g L⁻¹) and were acclimated to this higher salinity for 55 days prior to use in experimental cultures.

The salinity values of 25, 50, 75, 100, and 150 g L⁻¹ were prepared with distilled water by evaporation under vacuum at low (≤50°C) or high (≥200°C) temperatures or by dilution with distilled water. The salinity range selected covered the natural range of variability found in Mono and Abert lakes over the past 50–100 years. (Herbst 1988). Major ion chemistry of the two lakes is quite similar, both being of the sodium–bicarbonate type, and ion proportions remain constant over the range of salinities examined. Final salinity was adjusted to the specific gravity corresponding to the desired salinity of samples. All culture media were filtered through GF/A filters to remove potential contaminating algae and were enriched with sterile stock solutions prior to partitioning into replicate culture flasks. Enrichment consisted of primary nutrients (1.76 mM NaNO₃, 0.28 mM Na₂HPO₄, trace elements (che- rised 2.1 with ethylenediaminetetraacetic acid; 10 mM 1.8 Fe, 7.3 Mn, 0.8 Zn, 0.5 Cu, 2.0 Mo, 0.9 Co), and vitamins (in mg L⁻¹: 250 choline, 5 biotin, 2.5 cyanocobalamin).

Tulips of algae from stock-donated cultures were homogenized into a uniform suspension for inoculation by repeatedly drawing into and expelling algae from a 10-mL syringe. This well-mixed suspension of intact filament cells and akinetes was then immediately inoculated into 10-mL aliquots into these 50-mL replicas of each experimental culture treatment. Culture flasks were placed at random over a white background sheet beneath a bank of 40-W bulbs. The light intensity varied from 60 to 90 amol photons m⁻² s⁻¹ at the culture level. Flasks were periodically checked to ensure that light availability was consistent (although illumination levels were probably saturated). Light was maintained for 14:10 LD photoperiodic cycle, and temperature was held at 18°C.

Growth-yield determinations were made over a 6-month period for each culture. The final harvest rate was determined by filtering the flask content through a pre-weighed (GF/A) filter. The filters were then rinsed with 10-mL portions of sterile medium (an isotonic sodium bicarbonate solution) to remove any adhering salts and weighed after drying 48–72 h at 55°C. Small subsamples of algae were taken from each flask prior to harvest to determine the relative frequency of vegetative cells and akinetes. These subsamples were homogenized, dispersed on a slide, and 200–500 cells were counted in random fields of view at 400×, noting cell type and general morphological characteristics.

As the final harvest, rinsed algal filters were held on vacuum until they appeared free of excess water and then were gently blotted on absorbent tissue paper to remove adhering water. The weight difference between the fresh-harvested filter and the dried filter weight (corrected for the weight of the filter disk) was taken to represent the total water remaining in algal cells. Whole filters (dry) were extracted in 10-mL volumes of alkaline (MgCO₃ added) 90% acetone in a grounded-glasm homogenizer, stored 24 h at 4°C in darkness, and centrifuged. The optical density of the supernatant was read at 750 nm (absorbance correction) and 605 nm.

To examine whether Chlorella observed in Abert Lake Coriolis was at low salinity was related to nutrient limitation, the final set of three replicate flasks at 25 g L⁻¹ Abert Lake water were rinsed simultaneously with NaNO₃–Na₂HPO₄, both complete with trace elements and vitamins. Chlorophyll a levels in these cultures were then compared at the final harvest.

**RESULTS**

Increasing salinity of lake source culture water reduced vegetative growth of Coriolis clones from both Mono and Abert lakes (Fig. 1). Growth occurred up to 100 g L⁻¹, comparable to the results of Roinen (1985), and was almost completely inhibited at 150 g L⁻¹. Exponential growth rates (occurring over the initial growth period of about 1 month) decreased over the range 25–75 g L⁻¹, with algal growth rates declining from 1.2–1.5 mg d⁻¹ at 25 and 50 g L⁻¹ to about half this rate, 0.8–0.8 mg d⁻¹ at 75 g L⁻¹, with no exponential growth apparent at 100 g L⁻¹ (Table 1). Maximum yield also decreased in increasing salinities, with the exception of the Abert clone at 25 g L⁻¹. At this low salinity, despite initially high growth rates, the growth period of this clone was abbreviated, and the culture...
became increasingly chlorotic with age. Final yield was only equivalent to that found at 100 g L⁻¹, the highest salinity permitting growth.

Prior acclimation of algae at higher salinity (65 g L⁻¹) than that in stock cultures (40 g L⁻¹) produced no significant differences in yield (Table 2). With or without acclimation, yields at 100 g L⁻¹ were about half those found at 50 g L⁻¹, and essentially no growth occurred at 150 g L⁻¹. Nonetheless, differences in growth between the population sources do suggest that genetic variation for growth response to salinity exists. The Mono clone consistently showed greater growth than the Abert clone at comparable salinities in native lake waters (Tables 1, 2).

Both absolute and relative amounts of chlorophyll a increased in clones from eelgrass population as the culture medium salinity increased from 25 to 100 g L⁻¹ (Table 1). Observations of cell form suggest that chlorophyll a accumulated in small, slow-growing cells at higher salinity and diminished in elongate, fast-growing cells at dilute salinity. For the Abert Lake clone at 25 g L⁻¹, however, less chlorophyll a was formed as compared to 50 g L⁻¹, despite the fact that growth rates were higher and yield greater at 50 g L⁻¹ (Fig. 1, Table 1). Nutrient enrichment was equivalent for all salinities initially and far in excess of ambient levels of dissolved nitrogen in lake waters prior to enrichment. Supplemental enrichment of the final set of flasks containing chlorotic Abert algae at 25 g L⁻¹ with either nitrate or complete enrichment, resulted in substantial increases in chlorophyll a, but addition of phosphate had no effect (Table 1).

The proportion of akinetes versus vegetative cells changed at the different culture salinities (Fig. 2). Zoospores were infrequently observed and were not included in counts of cell type. Experimental cultures consisted almost entirely of vegetative cell filaments during early growth phase, except at 150 g L⁻¹, where the proportion of akinetes essentially the same as in the inoculum (50-55%). This indicates that virtually all akinetes from the inoculum (at either stock or acclimation salinity) germinated at 25–100 g L⁻¹, while those at 150 g L⁻¹ remained dormant (consistent with the results of Blinn 1971). Vegetative cells were swollen, empty (no chloroplast visible), and apparently dead. As reported by Blinn and Stein (1970), we also observed a decrease in the length of filament cells with increasing salinity. As growth rates declined with age in culture, akinetes began to form. This process also appeared to be accelerated by increasing salinity. Higher proportions of akinetes formed in the Abert clone (terminating filament growth) may have accounted for lower growth rates and yields compared to the Mono clone. In lower salinity cultures (25 and 50 g L⁻¹) of the Mono clone, some C. circulus occurred as an unusual cell type. Though not having the heavy walls of akinetes, these cells were similar in shape (spherical) and size (slightly smaller) and had dense dark-green contents (possibly unger-

**Table 1. Growth characteristics, chlorophyll a, and water content of *Chroococcus* clones at different salinities. Exponential growth calculated over early culture period (0-30 d) for cultures showing linear increase in log-log plots (Figs. 1, 2). Sample n = 3.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Source of Salinity (g L⁻¹)</th>
<th>Maximum water yield (kg m⁻²)</th>
<th>Chlorophyll content (µg Chl mg⁻¹ D.W.)</th>
<th>% water content (W)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mono Lake</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>220.5</td>
<td>88.7 (0.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>205.5</td>
<td>89.1 (0.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>75</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>187.7</td>
<td>88.4 (0.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>109.7</td>
<td>88.0 (0.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abert Lake</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1.18</td>
<td>74.4</td>
<td>90.5 (0.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>150.8</td>
<td>85.4 (0.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>75</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>127.5</td>
<td>84.7 (0.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>72.7</td>
<td>85.8 (0.5)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Growth unmeasurable.

**Table 2. C. circulus growth yield (21 weeks in culture) with and without acclimation to elevated salinity and analysis of variance for source, salinity, and acclimation effects and interactions. Algal inoculum was derived from a stock medium (65 g L⁻¹) or an acclimation medium (50 g L⁻¹) of native late water. Mean and [SE] for n = 3.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Source of Salinity (g L⁻¹)</th>
<th>Yield (kg m⁻²)</th>
<th>Acclimated</th>
<th>Non-acclimated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mono Lake</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.8</td>
<td>106.1</td>
<td>106.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>105.0</td>
<td>106.1</td>
<td>106.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>150</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>106.1</td>
<td>106.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abert Lake</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>105.0</td>
<td>106.1</td>
<td>106.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>107.0</td>
<td>106.1</td>
<td>106.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>150</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ANOVA table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>F value</th>
<th>P value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A) Lake</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>42.10</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B) Salinity</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>275.05</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C) Acclimation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>0.246</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interactions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>F value</th>
<th>P value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AB</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AC</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BC</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
minuted zoospores or incipient akinetes). Due to difficulty in distinguishing these cell differences, proportions are not reported for these treatments beyond the time that this other cell form appeared.

Water accounted for 85–90% of the wet weight of *Cenocladus* (Table 1). Over the 25–100 g L\(^{-1}\) salinity range, water content was unchanged in the Mono clone (ca. 88–89%) but decreased from 90% at 25 g L\(^{-1}\) to about 85% at each of the higher salinities in the Abert clone. This may be associated with the relative proportions of cell types rather than salinity effects per se, because the Abert clone consisted entirely of vegetative cells at 25 g L\(^{-1}\) and 14–30% akinetes at 50–100 g L\(^{-1}\) (Fig. 2). The thick-walled, dense cell contents of akinetes probably contain less water than the large, vacuolated spaces of vegetative cells.

Acclimated algae showed no significant growth enhancement compared to stock cultures of algae from either lake (Table 2). The main effects of the treatments were highly significant differences in yield due to salinity and lake source. A significant lake source × salinity interaction suggests the Mono clone may be more sensitive to salinity increase over the range 50–100 g L\(^{-1}\).

**DISCUSSION**

The inhibition of growth by increased salinity shown in our experiments agrees with the hypoth-


![Fig. 2. Changing percentage of *Cenocladus* cells that are dormant akinetes (versus vegetative filament cells) over the time course of culture growth for the Mono Lake clone (upper panel) and Abert Lake clone (lower panel). Unreplicated counts of 250–500 cells from subsamples of each treatment. Symbols for salinity treatments as in Figure 1.](image)


sis that productivity of *Cenocladus cirrosus* is natu-


rure depends on salinity. Growth rates of clones from Mono Lake and Abert Lake declined progressively from 25 to 100 g L\(^{-1}\) and ceased completely at 150 g L\(^{-1}\). The threshold limit for both vegetative growth and akinete germination was between 100 and 150 g L\(^{-1}\). Although low salinity limitations were not examined, yield and chlorophyll content were reduced at 25 g L\(^{-1}\) in the Abert Lake clone, possibly due to depletion of nitrates in batch cultures or reduced capacity for nitrogen uptake. When ni-


tragen supplement was provided, chlorophyll a lev-


evels increased in this treatment.

Although abundance of *Cenocladus* at Mono Lake may have been reduced by recent increases in the salinity of this lake, the superior growth of the Mono clone compared to that from Abert Lake suggests the possibility that selection for salt tolerance has produced ecotypic variants. However, only limited growth of *Cenocladus* occurred under hypersaline conditions (150 g L\(^{-1}\)), with or without acclimation to higher salinity.

Blinn (1971) showed that akinete germination in *Cenocladus* occurred with greatest success over a range from ca. 40 to 1700 mOsm (milliosmolar) and was almost completely inhibited above 2500 mOsm (equivalent to slightly more than 100 g L\(^{-1}\) of either Mono or Abert Lake water). Furthermore, forma-


tion of zoosporangia was not observed above 1400 mOsm, with only akinete production occurring at about 1600–1800 mOsm. These studies were con-


ducted with algae and experimental solutions origi-


nating from ephemeral pond water containing mainly Na-MgSO\(_4\) salts at alkaline pH. Although these are natural waters, they represent a limited chemical class in the varied waters of inland saline habitats. Nonetheless, the results are consistent with the salinity levels at which vegetative growth was inhibited in our study. Similarly, Ruimert (1953), us-


ing only NaCl solutions, reported active growth of *Cenocladus* (as *Lachnostomis ichnica*) up to a concen-


tration of 1.5 M NaCl (nearly 90 g L\(^{-1}\) total dis-


solved solids).

Studies of cultures of mixed benthic algae from both Mono and Abert lakes (Herbst and Bradley 1989) have shown broad salinity tolerance over the range 50–150 g L\(^{-1}\). Initial growth rates and the organic matter and pigment content of algae were reduced, however, as culture salinities were in-


creased over this range. The growth limitations ob-


served in these mixed cultures may be due partly to the poor growth of *Cenocladus* as exhibited in our experiments (Table 1). Though algae may survive or tolerate broad ranges of salinity, the rate of growth and amount of carbon fixed appear to be salinity-depen-


dent.

Field studies also suggest that a lower salinity range is optimal for the growth of *Cenocladus*. Wetzel
(1964) conducted quantitative studies of benthic and planktonic primary productivity in Borax Lake, California, and showed that benthic phytoplankton, consisting almost entirely of *Cyanobacteria*, constituted about 70% of the annual total. During these studies, the salinity of this shallow alkaline lake was between 30 and 60 g L$^{-1}$, optimal conditions for *Cyanobacteria* growth as defined by the present study. In algal floral surveys of the saline lakes of Saskatchewan, Hammer et al. (1985) found *Cyanobacteria* in lakes over a broad range of salinities, from 20 to 200 g L$^{-1}$. However, most of the hypersaline lakes sampled showed wide seasonal and annual variations in total dissolved solids. Because *Cyanobacteria* may persist at high salinity as akinetes, its presence in lakes of fluctuating salinity may indicate only that active vegetative growth occurs during the season of low salinity, and akinetes form when salt concentrations become non-permissive to growth. Blinn (1971) reported just such a phenomenon in ephemeral ponds of British Columbia and further noted the disappearance of *Cyanobacteria* from Little Manitou Lake over a period of years when salinity increased from about 100 to more than 200 g L$^{-1}$. The epilithic mats of *Cyanobacteria* common at Alber Lake under the low salinity conditions during our studies had largely disappeared by 1990, associated with falling lake levels from prolonged drought. By October 1992, salinity was well in excess of 200 g L$^{-1}$, and only akinetes of *Cyanobacteria* were present in sediments. However, when introduced into media at salinities of 25–75 g L$^{-1}$, akinetes germinated and normal *Cyanobacteria* arose.

Environmental factors other than salinity have also been reported to affect *Cyanobacteria*. Akinete germination was found to be optimal under alkaline pH1, at temperatures of about 10–15°C, and moderate irradiance (Blinn 1971). Blinn (1970) also found that Na/Mg ratios of less than 1.3 completely suppressed germination, and vegetative filament cells became longer and zoosporangia formed with an increasing proportion of sodium. Moreover, other monovalent cations could not replace sodium in producing these critical developmental processes. Although these results demonstrate dependence of growth on sodium, anionic proportions should also be examined as potential controlling influences.

The finding that the percent water content of *Cyanobacteria* remained constant over the salinity range 25–100 g L$^{-1}$ indicates that water balance is regulated in this algae. Other halophilic chlorophycean algae (such as *Dunaliella*) accumulate organic solutes such as glycerol to replace water lost to osmotic desiccation in hypersaline solutions (Halldorsson 1976). In cultures of *Cyanobacteria*, Blinn and Stein (1970) found that filament cells became shorter and wider as osmotic concentrations were increased. Assuming a cylindrical cross-section for these cells, the conversion of mean length and width data (from Blinn and Stein 1970) to surface-to-volume ratios shows that the ratio decreases as osmotic concentration increases (Fig. 3). This may represent a possible adaptive growth response to salinity stress by a passive mechanism that would minimize the osmotic loss of intracellular water through a change in cell morphology.

Benthic algae of saline lakes constitute an important food resource to brine flies (Ephyridae), often the most abundant benthic invertebrates in these ecosystems (Collins 1980, Herbst 1988, 1990). The alkali fly, *Ephydra hiemalis*, dominates the benthos of both Abert and Mono lakes, and though *Cyanobacteria* has been shown to be a relatively poor-quality food (Bradley and Herbst 1994), it is a common part of the natural diet (Herbst 1986). Development and reproduction of this insect are limited by decreasing quantity or quality of algal food available (Herbst 1992). The results reported here suggest that increased salinity may limit E. hiemalis growth and production by reducing the availability of an algal food resource. Other species of benthic algae such as diatoms (Kociolek and Zhou 1995) and cyanobacteria should also be cultured at varied salinities to further our understanding of benthic production and community structure in saline lake ecosystems.

The productivity of *Cyanobacteria* has been shown here to depend on salinity, but interactions with other physical and ecological factors, such as light, also affect its distribution. Grazing by fly larvae, rock substrate texture, wave shear forces, and the dynamics of competition with other epilithic algae are some of the influences that might profitably be examined and manipulated in field studies using introduced substrates and enclosures.


